

## Construction of Citizenship Education in Social Studies Textbooks in Punjab

Ayesha Khalid

### Introduction

The concept of citizenship has evolved from its conventional definition, restricted to the political and legal membership of citizens in a society, to its contemporary aspects which include citizens' rights and duties to fulfill civic entitlements and obligations. While the former concentrates on elements such as equal right to vote, to protest, and to have political debates, etc.; the latter focuses on citizens' working towards a common good. It was only after the French Revolution that the intrinsic value of citizenship and the instrumental value of equality based on liberal notions came together within the modern nation-state. These include ideas related to equality, freedom, and reconciliation. However, due to the constraints of neo-liberal policies and multiculturalism, the challenge remains in broadening the notion of citizenship in both theory and practice.

Citizenship education in Pakistani schools is integrated through Social Studies and Islamiyat textbooks perceived as inculcating religious & moral values, civic values, and duties as these subjects remain compulsory in all provinces. At the same time, national curricula in many religious countries include 'moral education' to instil rules and regulations within a religious context, such as in Pakistan and Iran. Other Muslim-majority countries like Malaysia and Turkey have devised moral education for non-Muslims in addition to Islamic education for Muslim students, to learn shared values of common good for their pluralistic societies. Both the above scenarios show that religious societies inculcate citizenship education through the ideas of peace and harmony based in Islam as Farahani & Salehi argue that Islam is a complete prospect for mutual harmony, societal unification, and justice according to several verses from the Holy Quran.[1] However, the current scenario in Pakistan which has compulsory Islamic education, shows a lack of education for social justice and transformation. One can then accept the argument that the Islamiyat curriculum was devised to generally focus

on establishing religious hegemony, as there is hardly any room for citizenship education for non-Muslim students as they must complete both the lengthy courses of Social Studies and Islamiyat.[2] Although Pakistan's National Education Policy 2009 stressed that promulgated curricula should be in accordance with the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which emphasize global citizenship. It is also closely related with SDG (Sustainable Development Goals) target 4.7, which is to inculcate critical global citizenship through the curriculum and school setting.

By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development (Goal 4.7, The UN Goals)

The statement above proposes that the knowledge and skills promoting ideas for sustainable life, equality, pluralism, and social justice should be a part of schooling. Textbooks are a good medium to understand national and social values at play, and how civic values are being taught and embedded in early childhood through a set of historical, ideological, or liberal concepts in the curriculum. Historically, the militarized curriculum under General Ayub's (1958–1969) education policy had few propositions for citizenry values.[3] The revised education policy during the Zia ul Haq regime under the National Education Policy and Implementation Program of 1979,[4] imparted particular Islamic values in the entire curriculum, neglecting pluralism and equality. Resultantly, the curriculum depicted the notion as if only Muslims were authorized to have a sense of citizenship while non-Muslims were excluded from Pakistani nationality. Major reforms also came about during the Musharraf era (1999–2008) that included Education Sector Reforms (ESR), which was devised in the wake of 9/11. Its main objective was to incorporate secular studies in religious institutions and establish an

inclusive curriculum to reduce sectarian and religious intolerance.[5] After the passage of the 18th amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan in 2010, the curriculum is now designed by autonomous provincial bodies. Still, the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board (PCTB) has been influenced by national policies such as the National Education Policy 2009 and follows the framework of the National Textbook and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action 2007. This paper researches the textbooks of Social Studies and Islamiat revised in 2007, since then, the new Single National Curriculum of Pakistan was developed in 2022. It is for future studies, that a comparison can be made as to how the new curriculum supports the SDG goals. While public schools follow the PCTB curriculum, numerous local publishers have designed textbooks for private schools by following the Cambridge curriculum. There are approximately 4 million students currently enrolled in government primary schools[6] and as per the World Bank, enrollment in private schools has risen from 36 to 38 per cent in Pakistan.

### Research Problem, Objective and Methodology

Civic education being a prominent subject in early schooling in most liberal democracies can be associated with the level of productivity, work ethic, community building, and higher levels of tolerance in society.[7] The Pakistani education curriculum is however based on the amalgamation of both ideological frameworks as well as modern liberal education with the added complexity of multiple school systems. In one of the studies done on civic education in Pakistan, three out of four respondents declared that they received no civic education in schools, colleges, or universities.[8]

While several studies have been undertaken how citizenship is constructed in textbooks, there has been little research on the pedagogical implications of the content in Social Studies textbooks. This study aims to fill this gap by providing insights into how Social Studies textbooks in Punjab construct the notion of citizenship, if and how this notion is different in public versus private school textbooks, and how teachers influence students' understanding of citizenship edu-

cation in public and private schools respectively, with the view to give sound and viable recommendations to improve citizenship education.

This qualitative research analyzes the contents of Social Studies textbooks for citizenship education using Discourse Analysis. The contents of the General Knowledge/Social Studies textbooks published by PCTB & Oxford University Press (OUP) for classes 3-5 have been analyzed to identify the presence of or lack of citizenship elements. Furthermore, in-depth interviews were conducted with heads of the Social Studies department, class teachers, and students of classes 3, 4, and 5, both in private and public schools respectively.

### Conceptual Framework

Mal Leicester centralizes the feeling of citizens' identity at the base of solidarity, mutual respect, and execution of democratic institutions. For him, a person's sense of dignity is the recognition of an interpersonal feeling that presupposes the relationship among citizens of a community.[9] This puts an added burden on the educational curriculum to instill the above values as it is an important contributor to identity construction.

Sears & Hughes conceptualize citizenship education based on different levels such as knowledge, values, and skills while assigning it a progression from formal understanding towards contemporary learning, which involves inclusive activities and freedom of expression to achieve justice and equality for every race, religion or ethnicity.[10] They consider a commitment to environmental responsibility, social justice, pluralism, and anti-racism as key values that students should develop to understand that their choices and actions have global consequences. As globalization progresses, societies need more fluidity and flexibility in citizenship education models. However, academic literature that touches upon the concept of citizenship education usually fails to form a link between globalization, citizenship, and technology. This is especially true in the context of emerging mass electronic media as the meaning of pedagogy is also changing.

Further, Anderson et al. argue that the role of citizenship education is not a subject matter in the same sense as history or the social sciences, even though it is purportedly a purpose of social studies, and various reports by commissions and councils, and frameworks designed by social studies' educators consider citizenship education as *raison d'être* of social science.[11] But, it could be a challenge to incorporate citizenship principles such as history, geography, civic values, and democratic state-building elements in the social studies curriculum. Here, Barr, Barth, and Shermis' articulation of three main traditions in the social studies curriculum shed light on how this challenge may be overcome as these traditions focus on different purposes and methods of social studies curriculum. [12] The first, Citizenship Transmission (CT) provides students with fundamental knowledge, values, and skills to become responsible citizens; second, Social Studies as Social Science (SS) focuses on teaching the structure and method of social science, and last, Reflective Inquiry (RI) encourages value analysis and decision making through the exploration of significant problems and issues in society.

Based on the above discussion, I have identified twelve elements to assess the level of citizenship education within the Social Studies curriculum which

include: the definition of citizenship, accuracy of historical facts, political awareness, social responsibility, civic engagement, rights and duties, critical and participatory learning, factual accuracy, and elements of inclusivity and sexism. Due to limitations of the subject matter in Punjab's Social Studies textbooks, I have further consolidated citizenship education into four main elements: civic values, participative learning, political awareness, and discriminatory elements; for ease of comparative analysis between PCTB and Oxford Social Studies textbooks.

### Research Findings

At the primary level, children are essentially learning key concepts of the topics that they will be studying in higher classes. The government of Pakistan has formulated benchmarks for each class for the subject of General Knowledge/Social Studies, based on which textbooks are devised in each province. The benchmarks prominently propose a progression from class 1-3 to class 4-5 and have standardized values that are to be promoted in textbooks. For instance, understanding rights and duties, institutions, and global citizenship are some of the concepts that may become part of the curriculum.

Table. Citizenship Education in the PCTB & Oxford (OUP) Textbooks for Class 3,4, 5

Constituents of Citizenship Education	Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board	Oxford University Press
Definition of Citizenship	Not present in grades 1-4, Traditional definition in grade 5	Traditional Definition
Historical Facts	Inconsistent/Biased	Unbiased; however lacking depth
Political Awareness	Average	Above Average
Social Responsibility	Average	Above Average
Civic Engagement	Not Present	In Activity Only
Rights	Little Information	Present
Duties	Average	Not Present
Critical Learning or Memorization	Memorization	Critical Learning (Activity Based)
Participative Learning	No	Yes
Factual Accuracy	Minimal	Maximal
Elements of Sexism	Present	Present
Elements of Inclusivity	Not Present	Present

### Civic Values:

Till class 3, the General Knowledge textbook in the PCTB curriculum provides basic information about the environment and helps create a national identity based on state religion. There is no information about the political history or social responsibility of being a citizen. Whereas, Oxford class 3 Social Studies has a separate unit on citizenship, which helps students develop a national identity through the traditional understanding of citizenship. All the main religions are given equal value in text with illustrations of their place of origin. Rights and duties are mentioned in a very didactic manner, with no participative skills proposed. In the PCTB textbook, three rights are mentioned i.e., to have schools for education, hospitals for health, and police to help guard one's life. In contrast, rights in Oxford textbooks are mentioned with contemporary ideas of citizenship such as: the right to be loved, the right to life and freedom, the right to belong to a country, the right to education and health facilities, etc.

In classes 4 and 5, with the conventional definition of citizenship provided in the Social Studies textbooks, the notion is conceptualized as having nationality of a particular country. Civic values or civic engagement roles have been mentioned minimally and these encompass only basic human rights and duties. Though definitions of good citizens are emphasized in PCTB textbooks, there is still no elaboration of these definitions for contemporary understanding. Positive and negative externalities of human actions/behaviour are not mentioned. However, participatory learning of citizenship is promoted through extra-curricular activities in some schools. For example, understanding of Climate Change is not prominent in textbooks but many private schools incorporate activities related to Global Warming and recycling. Under social values, only birth rituals, marriage, and death rites are mentioned in PCTB books.

### Political Awareness & Discriminatory Elements

In class 4 and 5 Oxford Social Studies books, greater value is given to general information about Pakistan's resources, government, history, arts, and festivals in progression. Class 5 gives information on neighbour-

ing countries and Pakistan's position in the world. Whereas, class 4 and 5 PCTB books lack a proper progression. Historical events are stated on the surface without a context. Additionally, only historical figures from Punjab are mentioned. For instance, in class 4, it is implied that the movement for the creation of Pakistan arose from Punjab, "the fertile land of Punjab and its hardworking people raised the importance of Pakistan in the eyes of British." The text does not give any information about the "movement." There is no mention of the role of other provinces in the events leading up to independence including that of East Bengal.

While both PCTB and Oxford books are filled with gender-biased roles in text and illustration, the PCTB books have elements of blatant sexism. Gender roles are defined for women as homemakers, as nurses or teachers; and more strenuous work is allocated to men. Further in PCTB textbooks, distorted history is given as facts while requiring memorization, that leaves no room for further questioning. Very little information is given about other provinces and their cultures. Furthermore, the chapters on cultures and festivals of various provinces instead inculcate an 'us versus them' prejudice. Moreover, modernization is equated with Westernization and is considered immoral. Modernization and Westernization are further denoted by clothing and the use of mobile phones.

Text in Oxford textbooks only provides information on the rights of students whereas no information is given on voluntary actions and obligations. In PCTB textbooks, however, self-awareness and political awareness have been argued along the nationalist narrative of the state. Overall, all books lack current affairs and up-to-date portrayals of the country's national and global matters.

Interviews conducted in both private and government schools suggested that primary-level students had a sense of patriotism infused with hatred towards Hindus and other minorities. Students in public schools also showed hostility towards other ethnicities such as Sindhis or Pashtuns and categorized people from other religious backgrounds as 'kafir/infidel' and

'bad'. We relate this with the use of loaded words to describe citizenship in Social Studies textbooks that develop no social responsibility towards other members of society while encouraging students to be hostile towards minorities. This is because PCTB Social Studies textbooks focus mainly on Punjab without an element of inclusivity of other cultures.

### Participative Learning of Citizenship Concepts

The learning instruments such as text, teaching, and activities work in coherence to form a learning environment for a child. As much as the text influences the notion of citizenship among students, it was observed that teachers and school administration play a vital role in developing an understanding of these concepts. During the interviews in both public and private schools, students were more comfortable talking in private than in the presence of a teacher. They were hesitant to speak their minds freely in front of a teacher as classrooms were filled with the fear of authority. Thus, when children themselves are not aware of their rights and duties, they may as well lack the ability to feel responsible for certain actions.

Civic education and active citizenship are not given enough representation in the content of Social Studies textbooks. As in PCTB textbooks, rights and duties are merely written which neither encourages participative learning nor critical reasoning in the classrooms. Therefore, the notion of citizenship is passive and conventional, and children cannot imbibe the notion of 'good citizen' in their daily lives as they do not see themselves as active members of society.

Further, the books do not inculcate the values of citizenship and morality independent of the conditionality of religion or patriotism. Further, there is little room for children to practice what they learn leading them to be passive learners of these concepts with no engagement with the real world. Thus, the concepts they read have no real implications.

### Conclusion & Policy Recommendations

Overall, the contents of both PCTB and Oxford books do not resonate with the proposed curriculum bench-

marks defined by the Government of Pakistan while the curriculum lacks progression from class 1 to 5 concerning civic education and participative learning. There is ample evidence of the negation of citizenship education in these textbooks: discrimination towards marginalized genders, religions, and ethnicities, and a lack of understanding of global issues altogether. Furthermore, the classrooms don't provide students an environment for healthy debate and discussion to make learning more reflective. Thus, we are raising a generation that may not be considered informed and active citizens.

Despite the errors and inaccuracies, both textbooks have their pros and cons in teaching the concept of citizenship. The four million students studying PCTB textbooks are being instilled with a narrative that undermines religious plurality, portrays the glorification of one ethnicity over the other, and does not encourage participative learning as experiential education is limited to activities provided in the chapters. Comparatively, OUP Social Studies textbooks have additional activities to promote a sense of active citizenship. For instance, there is an activity in class 4 to visit any local voluntary organization that helps people to understand the organization's work. PCTB textbooks could thus be categorized as merely providing a formal understanding of citizenship whereas Oxford textbooks have a more reflective learning approach that promotes active citizenship.

How states define citizenship and how effectively their education policy cultivates the values of empathy, compassion, and basic civil rights and responsibilities, goes a long way to transform a country's value system. Thus, to build a more inclusive and civically conscious society where citizens are informed of each other's rights & duties, the educationists need to reform the education system in Punjab. For this purpose, the following policy recommendations are suggested:

**Eliminate Discriminatory Elements by Accepting Cultural Diversity and Global Citizenship:** The Government of Punjab needs to revise the curriculum to

remove distorted history; gender bias; and prejudice towards other ethnicities, religious minorities, and races; as this is at the core of global citizenship. Instead, cultural and religious diversity should be acknowledged through knowledge about diverse cultures and religions in Pakistan.

**Concentrate on Content Depth rather than Number of Topics:** The PCTB textbooks need to include details of pre/post-independence history rather than mentioning a list of names and dates, as few but in-depth topics would improve comprehension while a large number of topics would only lead to memorization.

**Encourage Reflective Approach & Active Engagement:** The PCTB should incorporate global and national issues using a reflective approach by adding exercises of civic engagement to supplement theory, as more than theory, children learn through practice. Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) need to be kept in mind while reforming the education policy.

**Conduct Teacher Training on Content & Critical Pedagogy:** Teacher training must be provided by subject specialists so that teachers can reform and redevelop content to give more detailed information to students. Additionally, the authoritative role of the teacher needs to be transformed into that of a discussant to allow for critical engagement with the concepts.

## References

- Anderson, Christopher. "Divergent Perspectives on Citizenship Education: A Q-Method Study and Survey of Social Studies Teachers." *American Educational Research Journal* 34, no.2 (January 1997): 333-364
- Barr, Robert D., James L. Barth and S. Samuel Shermis. *Defining the Social Studies*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 1977.
- Dean, Bernadette. "Citizenship Education in Pakistani schools: Problems and possibilities." *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education* 1, no. 2, (2005): 35-51.
- Farahani, Ezzat Allah Kishani, and Akbar Salehi. "Development Model of Islamic Citizenship Education." *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences* 89, (2013): 64-68. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.08.810.
- Government of Pakistan. Ministry of Federal Education & Professional Training, Islamabad. Curriculum for Social Studies 4-5, 2017. Accessed April 4, 2018. [http://www.moent.gov.pk/userfiles1/file/Social%20Studies%20IV%20-V%20\(20-09-17\).pdf](http://www.moent.gov.pk/userfiles1/file/Social%20Studies%20IV%20-V%20(20-09-17).pdf)
- Government of Punjab. "School Education Department, 2011". <http://schoolportal.punjab.gov.pk/census/schoolcensusNew.htm> accessed (01 October, 2017).
- Haider, Murtaza. "Pakistan's need for Civic Education". *DAWN*, 2 April 2014. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1097292>.
- Jamieson, Kathleen. "The Challenges Facing Civic Education in the 21st Century." *Dædalus, the Journal of the American Academy of Arts & Sciences* 2, (2013): 65-83.
- Javed, Muhammad and Azar Ali. "Educational Development in Pakistan: A Critical Appraisal of Muhammad Pervez Musharraf Presidency (1999-2008)." *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications* 7, no. 3, (2017): 277-282.
- Leicester, Mal, Celia Modgil and Sohan Modgil. ed. *Politics, Education and Citizenship*. London and New York: Falmer Press, 2000.
- Ministry of Education. National Education Policy and Implementation Programme. Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 1997.
- Rodrik, Dani. *One Economics, Many Recipes: Globalization, Institutions and Economic Growth*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2007.

---

[1] Ezzat Allah Kishani Farahani and Akbar Salehi, "Development Model of Islamic Citizenship Education," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 89, (2013): 64-68, doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.08.810.

[2] Bernadette L. Dean, "Citizenship Education in Pakistani Schools: Problems and Possibilities," *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education* 1, no. 2, (2005): 40.

[3] Bernadette L. Dean, "Citizenship Education in Pakistani Schools: Problems and Possibilities," *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education* 1, no. 2, (2005): 45.

[4] Ministry of Education, *National Education Policy and Implementation Programme*. (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 1979)

[5] Muhammad Javed and Azar Ali, "Educational Development in Pakistan: A Critical Appraisal of Muhammad Parvez Musharraf Presidency," *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publi-*

cations 7, no. 3, (2017): 279.

[6] Government of the Punjab. "School Education Department, 2011", under 'Census', <http://schoolportal.punjab.gov.pk/census/schoolcensusNew.htm> (accessed 01 October, 2017)

[7] Kathleen Jamieson, "The Challenges Facing Civic Education in the 21st Century," *Daedalus, the Journal of the American Academy of Arts & Sciences* 2, (2013): 67.

[8] Murtaza Haider, "Pakistan's Need for Civic Education," *DAWN*, 02 April 2014.

[9] Mal Leicester et al., ed., *Politics, Education and Citizenship*, (London and New York: Falmer Press, 2000), 228.

[10] Alan M. Sears and Andrew S. Hughes, "Citizenship Education and Current Educational Reform," *Canadian Journal of Education / Revue canadienne de l'éducation* 21, no. 2, (1996): 130-135, accessed March 14, 2017, doi:10.2307/1495085.

[11] Christopher Anderson et al., "Divergent Perspectives on Citizenship Education: A Q-Method Study and Survey of Social Studies Teachers," *American Educational Research Journal* 34, no. 2, (1997): 351.

[12] Robert D. Barr, James L. Barth and S. Samuel Shermis, *Defining the Social Studies* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 01 September, 1977), 35-37.

## Interfaith Dialogue Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow: The Case of Lahore District

Naseer John

MPhil Forman Christian College 2017

### Introduction

Lahore, the capital city of Punjab province has remained a multi-religious and multicultural space for centuries. People from various beliefs, ethnic and cultural backgrounds used to live here and took part in the joys, sorrows, famines, and festivals of each other.<sup>17</sup> Lahore has been home to eight major religions of the world i.e. Hinduism, Buddhism, Jainism, Zoroastrianism, Christianity, Islam, Judaism and Sikhism<sup>18</sup> and people from diverse religious arrays enjoyed interreligious dialogue, where they shared their world-views and perspectives freely.<sup>19</sup> This religious diversity can be seen through the various mosques, shrines, churches, temples, and gurdwaras that spot the city.<sup>20</sup>

But at present, Lahore has lost most of its religious and cultural diversity, and interreligious harmony due to the cataclysmic violence of Partition in which 11.2 million people crossed the newly drawn border<sup>21</sup> with Hindus and Sikhs migrating to India. The Hindu, Sikh and Muslim communities which had coexisted for approximately a millennium violently attacked each other and as a result, thousands lost their lives in the carnage.<sup>22</sup>

After independence, religious violence erupted in the early 1950's in Lahore, against the Ahmadiyya community. After that, Lahore generally maintained its tradition of interfaith harmony but the conflict returned in the 1970s and heightened in the 1980s, initially against the Ahmadiyya community and later also against the Christians. Structural discrimination based on laws and recurring violent incidences has tested the pluralistic, multi-cultural, and harmonious

<sup>17</sup> Majid Sheikh, *Lahore the tales without End* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 2015).

<sup>18</sup> Ibid.

<sup>19</sup> Shahid Mukhtar, *Din-e-Ila'hi Aghaz Say Anjam Tak* (Lahore: Shahid Publishers and Book Sales) 100-131.

<sup>20</sup> F.S. Aijazuddin, *Lahore Recollected an Almumb* (Lahore: Sange-e-Meel Publications, 2004).

<sup>21</sup> K. Hill, W. Selzer, J. Leaning, S. J. Malik et al., "The Demographic Impact of Partition in Punjab in 1947", *Population Studies*, Vol. 62, No. 2, (2008): 155-170.

<sup>22</sup> William Dalrymple, "The Great Divide", *The New Yorker*, June, 22, 2015. <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2015/06/29/the-great-divide-books-dalrymple>